# The Scottish Musical Society, 1879–1900: Ambitions and Legacy

# Fiona M. Donaldson University of Edinburgh

For over 100 years the original papers of the Scottish Musical Society lay abandoned and untouched in the basement of the Reid Concert Hall in the University of Edinburgh in a large black metal deed box marked 'Scottish Musical Society'. Inside the box, the papers of the society included minutes, letters in original envelopes, leaflets, newspapers, receipts and notices, mostly covered in dust. The discovery of the box led the present author to explore its contents and to learn more about the Scottish Musical Society. The ambitions of the individuals involved in the Society as detailed in the papers, their plans to establish an Academy of Music in Scotland, and what shaped and guided these ambitions, will be discussed in this article.

As with all best intentions, circumstances conspired to influence and frustrate the creative and enthusiastic ambitions of this new Society as observed in the activities undertaken and the challenges faced by the Society during its short life. The name of the Scottish Musical Society (SMS) is largely unknown and rarely occurs in printed publications. However, the Society's contribution to the discussions within the Scottish Universities' Commission relating to the draft ordinances on the institution of a Faculty of Music, and regulations for the Reid Professor of Music at the University of Edinburgh in the early 1890s, has been recognised. This article will give an overview of the ambitions of the Society, the individuals associated with the organisation, and possible reasons for its failure.

In late nineteenth-century Scotland, there were limited opportunities for the public to receive a quality musical education and to hear a good variety of chamber and orchestral music. Around the country there were excellent music teachers and orchestral musicians, but not in any great numbers, and there was little interest in music as an academic subject. The Edinburgh Institution for Music offered instrumental instruction and lessons in music theory,<sup>2</sup> and at the Glasgow Atheneum classes were available in commerce, philosophy, literature, languages and music.<sup>3</sup> Farmer gives an excellent account of the music education being offered in schools in Edinburgh and Glasgow in the late nineteenth

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Golding 2013, p. 154; Farmer 1947, p. 397.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Unknown 1869, p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Smith 2009.

century. He identifies the School Board system introduced in 1872 by the Education Act (Scotland) as the starting point for more structured musical instruction in Scottish schools.<sup>4</sup>

To obviate the need for students to travel from Scotland to London and beyond for musical training, the Scottish Musical Society wanted to open an Academy of Music in Scotland.<sup>5</sup> The Society also had plans to establish a full-time resident professional orchestra in Scotland, similar to the Crystal Palace Orchestra in London and the Hallé Orchestra in Manchester, which would work closely with students attending the new Scottish Academy of Music.<sup>6</sup>

# The men behind the Society

It was a small group of highly educated men comprising leading academics, law-yers, politicians and businessmen, all with a keen interest in music, who gathered in Edinburgh in October 1879, at the home of the Scottish classical scholar Dr James Donaldson,<sup>7</sup> to discuss 'Dr Donaldson's scheme for the formation of a Society for Musical Education'.<sup>8</sup> This meeting may have been triggered by a report prepared by Dr John Hullah in 1879 stating that music teaching in Britain was inferior to that in Continental training schools.<sup>9</sup> Hullah's report supported Donaldson's own research in the late 1870s into the viability of such a project in Scotland. Donaldson was satisfied that there were sufficient numbers of suitable local and foreign teachers in the Edinburgh area, in addition to interest from a number of prominent individuals, and he had been given an indication of some Government funding to support his ideas.<sup>10</sup> His scheme was concerned with a national plan, to open an Academy of Music for Scotland, 'whose head-quarters shall be in Edinburgh'.<sup>11</sup> With support for his plans at the first meeting,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Farmer 1947, pp. 380-385.

Records of the Scottish Musical Society (SMS) are held by Edinburgh University Library (EUL), Special Collections, Main Library, George Square, Edinburgh, ref: Coll-1385.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> SMS 1881.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Craik 2004.

A meeting 'of gentlemen present' was held on 22 October 1879. Present at this first meeting were James Donaldson LLD; W. W. Hunter, LLD, CIE; Alex. W Potts LLD; John Kirkhope, Jun., Merchant; R. Vary Campbell, LLB, Advocate; Robert A. Marr. SMS 1879a, p. 1 (Minutes of the SMS Edinburgh Committee Council Meeting, 22 October 1879). Dr James Donaldson, the Scottish classical scholar, educationalist and theologian, was born in Aberdeen, and educated at Aberdeen Grammar School, and in 1879 was Rector of the Royal High School in Edinburgh. He became Professor of Humanity in the University of Aberdeen in 1881, and in 1890 was appointed Principal of the University of St Andrews.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Hullah 1880.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Donaldson 1913, pp. 5–6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 1 (Minutes of the SMS Edinburgh Committee Council Meeting, 22 October 1879).

Donaldson was asked to prepare a written constitution for discussion at their next meeting on 29 October. 12

The objects of the Society, as stated in item one of the Constitution, were 'to foster, encourage and aid musical ability in the attainment of high vocal or instrumental excellence, and of eminence in musical composition' in Scotland. <sup>13</sup> The subsequent publicity material pointed out that 'Scotland has no means of giving the highest musical education, and Scotland has no resident orchestra'. <sup>14</sup> On these two facts was based the necessity for an Association such as the Scottish Musical Society. The Society 'will endeavour in every possible way to encourage the study of music and to render the profession of music dignified and honourable'. <sup>15</sup> The objects of the Society were considered to be of 'great national importance' and the Council members were confident of 'that support which is necessary to render its operations a complete success'. <sup>16</sup>

This was an admirable endeavour to match the benefits of a wider European musical education as evident, for example, from the travels of Alexander Campbell Mackenzie (1847–1935). Mackenzie had, on the advice of his father, a leading violinist in Edinburgh, travelled to Germany and France in the late 1850s to study violin and composition and returned to work in Scotland as a violinist, composer and teacher in 1865. In 1887, he moved from Edinburgh to take up the position of Principal of the Royal Academy of Music in London. The transfer of skills also worked in the opposite direction, with many musicians in the latter part of the nineteenth-century coming from mainland Europe to live and work in the United Kingdom, continuing a trend established in previous centuries. This can be seen from advertisements for music lessons in British newspapers and in the lists of orchestra members participating in local concerts across the country. 18

A number of Scottish noblemen, including the Duke of Hamilton and the Duke of Montrose, were approached and became Vice-Presidents of the Society. The day-to-day running of the organisation became the responsibility of over 30 interested individuals who were invited to become members of the Council of the Society. This body comprised advocates, lawyers and sheriffs, university

<sup>12</sup> SMS n.d.a, item 4.

<sup>13</sup> SMS n.d.a, item 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> SMS 1881, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> SMS 1881, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> SMS 1881, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Mackenzie 1927, pp. 155–168.

Scrutiny of the lists of orchestra members from Reid concerts given in Edinburgh between 1869 and 1888 by the Hallé Orchestra shows members with titles such as Herr, Signor and Mons. This suggests that they may have been of German, Italian or French origin. There is also the possibility that they may have been British musicians who had adopted a foreign sounding name or title to improve their status in the profession. See Donaldson 2015.

professors, merchants, manufacturers, writers and stockbrokers from Edinburgh, Aberdeen, Glasgow and Dundee. His Grace, The Duke of Buccleuch and Queensberry, accepted the role of President of the Society, and Professor Sir Herbert Stanley Oakeley, Professor of Music at the University of Edinburgh, initially accepted with great pleasure the office of Chairman of the Council and also that of a Vice-President'. Oakeley also offered to hold meetings of the Council in the University Music Class Room. However, his position changed when later it was decided that professional musicians could not be Council members. In his place, The Rt Hon. the Earl of Rosebery (later Prime Minister) was appointed Chairman of the Council. Rosebery, however, stated in a letter that he had no wish to preside at any meetings of the Society. Donaldson was appointed Vice-Chairman of the Council and chaired the meetings. Both noblemen promised an initial donation of £500, payable on the opening of the Academy, and were considered useful names to add to publicity material in the hope of attracting financial support for the Society. Professor Sir Herbert Stanley and Stanley Stanl

Although, as Oakeley said in a subsequent letter to the Society, he 'did not consider himself a professional musician', he accepted the situation and continued to serve as an ex officio Vice-President of the Society, saying that if he could offer any advice he would 'endeavour to give it to the best of [his] judgement'.<sup>23</sup> While the Council included James Muir Wood, music publisher in Glasgow, and John Kirkhope Jun., an Edinburgh wine merchant who also conducted a choir, and many other amateur musicians, there were no professional musicians.<sup>24</sup>

The constitution stated that the office-bearers 'may consist of persons who are not professional musicians'; <sup>25</sup> however, it was made clear in the publicity material that 'none of the members of the Council were professional musicians, and all have only the interest of the public at heart', although special provision was made for 'taking their [professional musicians'] advice as Fellows of the Society'. <sup>26</sup> Thus, while planning to set up an Academy of Music and a full-time orchestra,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The names and occupations of the Council members are listed in SMS 1881.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Oakeley 1880.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Rosebery 1881.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> SMS 1879b (Letter from Mr R. Marr on behalf of SMS Council to His Grace The Duke of Buccleuch, 22 July 1879); confirmed in SMS 1881. It is interesting to note that £500 was the amount the musician John Distin expected to realise from his farewell concert in 1857. In a letter to the Marquis of Breadalbane, he requests a loan, which he promises to repay, stating that, 'All the artists advise [*sic*] me to give the Concert as soon as I can, and they assure me I shall realise 4 or £500 by it'. Dinstin 1857. Thanks to Lance Whitehead for bringing this source to my attention.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Oakeley 1882.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> SMS 1882a, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> SMS n.d.a, item 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Unknown 1880.

the society had no input from professional musicians on the Council. Perhaps in this the Society made a mistake, as formal input from musicians in Scotland might have helped the Society achieve greater success in its ambitions. They had also replaced their original choice of Chairman of the Council, Professor Oakeley, with the Earl of Rosebery, who was seen as more influential in attracting funds for the Society. Furthermore, Professor Oakeley may have been a little aggrieved to be supplanted by the Earl of Rosebery as Chairman, and this perhaps explains the comments of Professor Donaldson when he described the Professor of Music as 'an obstacle' to the ambitions of the Society.<sup>27</sup>

# **Fundraising ambitions and challenges**

The target of the Society was to raise capital by selling 20,000 shares at £1 each, with power to increase the capital. The minimum initial income required was considered to be £3,000, to found an Academy of Music in Edinburgh which would offer, for the first time in Scotland, a complete musical education for Scottish students, taught by the best masters, and where skill in all the principal musical instruments may be acquired. The Society hoped to offer bursaries to enable students of merit to have all the advantages of the best musical training otherwise beyond their means. The intention was that in a few years the Academy would become self-supporting, but that in the meantime, a considerable sum [was] required to defray the expense of starting the Institution. In order that it might be capable of receiving legacies and administering property, on 5 June 1880 the Society was incorporated as a company limited by shares, the members of which were excluded from making any gain by it. In addition to the sums paid for shares it was desirable that donations and annual subscriptions should be given.

Contributions to fund the ambitions of the Scottish Musical Society were invited in the form of applications for shares, or of donations and annual subscriptions, with the intention of allowing the operations of the Academy to commence in 1883. Share-application, donation and subscription forms were printed and circulated to friends of the council members. In June and July 1880, advertisements with full details of the share scheme were placed in newspapers from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Donaldson 1913, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> SMS 1880a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> SMS 1881, p. 1.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> SMS 1882a, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> SMS 1880a: 'Incorporated with limited liability, as an association, for the promotion of Art, under the authority of the Board of Trade under the Companies Acts, 1862, 1867, and 1877. Memorandum and Articles of Association registered 05 June 1880'; reported in Unknown 1880b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> SMS 1881, p. 2.

Banff to Belfast, and appeared across several columns on the front pages of these publications.<sup>34</sup> Articles and advertisements were also placed in music journals.<sup>35</sup> Local branch committees were set up in Aberdeen, Dundee, Edinburgh and Glasgow to focus on approaches to local businesses and wealthy individuals, with a view to soliciting shareholders and subscribers, and to collecting donations on behalf of the Society.<sup>36</sup>

In March 1882, public meetings were held in Edinburgh and Glasgow to which 'ladies and gentlemen interested in the promotion of music in Scotland [were] respectfully invited to attend'.<sup>37</sup> These meetings were chaired by Lord Reay, and detailed reports were printed in the *The Scotsman* and *The Musical Times*, extolling the virtues of listening to music as a healthy pursuit for the hours intended for relaxation, and encouraging all Scotsmen to support this good cause.<sup>38</sup>

In 1883, to strengthen further the fundraising effort, the Council agreed to put the two cities of Edinburgh and Glasgow 'on an equal footing as to the formation of classes'.<sup>39</sup> The Edinburgh Town Council agreed to subscribe 100 guineas; Mr Andrew Carnegie Esq., New York, 500 guineas; the Rt. Hon. George Harrison, Lord Provost of Edinburgh, 10 guineas; and several other small subscriptions were promised, but only on the condition that the Academy was established and started up.<sup>40</sup>

Confident of securing these elusive funds the Society looked for a suitable building for the new Academy in Edinburgh. One of the buildings considered as a location was at 5 Queen Street, owned by the United Presbyterian Church and known at the time as the Synod Hall. Enquiries were made, and rental of the premises was quoted at £65 for six months.<sup>41</sup> This building was subsequently used as a meeting room for the newly formed Edinburgh Society of Musicians in

<sup>34</sup> SMS 1880c.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Unknown 1880.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> The secretaries of the Aberdeen Branch were W. Kendall Burnett and James Walker; Dundee Branch Secretaries were Peter G. Walker (resigned July 1880) and James Mann; and the Glasgow Branch Secretary was James Airlie (organiser of concerts at the City Hall in Glasgow). SMS 1880b, p. 3 (Minutes of the first Ordinary Meeting of the SMS, 1 October 1880).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Public meetings were held at the Accountants' Hall, Glasgow on Tuesday 7 March and at the Royal Hotel, 53 Princes Street, Edinburgh on Wednesday, 8 March,1882, to 'consider a scheme for procuring a permanent orchestra for Scotland and for establishing an Academy of Music in Edinburgh'. SMS 1882b.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Unknown 1882.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 23 (Minutes of the SMS General Meeting, 16 March 1883).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 33 (Minutes of the Council Meeting, 16 March 1883); SMS 1883.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Slight 1882; the rental charge for the whole building was £65, or separately for the Upper hall and ante-room, £30, Old mission board room £15, Large classroom £20, Library £10.

1887, and known in the 1890s as the Queen's Hall when it was a popular venue for concerts. It was used as a cinema from 1897 until 1915 and, from 1924 until 2002, was the home of the BBC in the city. $^{42}$ 

The set-up costs of £3,000 suggested by the Council were accompanied by estimates showing capital expenditure for three academic terms (or four quarters), and an orchestra for a three-month season. The Council based these details on information collected from music festivals in Birmingham, Leeds and Bristol relating to costs of performances in the early 1880s. From Edinburgh Choral Union, the members acquired a treasurer's statement for 1878–9 and a list of artists who had participated in Edinburgh Choral Union concerts between December 1865 and December 1875. The Society may also have consulted Professor Oakeley, in his ex-officio role, in respect of costs associated with the annual Reid Concert at the University of Edinburgh.

Oakeley would have been able to confirm that the cost of bringing the Hallé orchestra by train to Edinburgh from Manchester, with conductor and soloists was around £500.<sup>45</sup> The salaries of all University of Edinburgh professors were published in the University Calendar, giving Council members an indication of the kind of salary the principal of their proposed academy might expect to receive.<sup>46</sup> The Council was working hard to gather all the information it needed regarding costs, but this was not matched by the income from their fundraising activities.

# **Proposed Principal for the new Scottish Academy of Music**

Funds were slow in coming in, and the Society looked at what more they could do to achieve the remaining funds required to establish the Academy. To raise the profile of the Society and attract greater attention to their plans, the Council believed that it was important to announce the name of an eminent musician who would be Principal of the Academy. The Society received interest in the post from musicians such as the composer and conductor Adolf Beyschlag, who was based in Belfast and submitted testimonials, concert programmes and supplemental documentation in support of his wish to be considered for the post. The Council also, through personal contacts and recommendations, made their own enquiries across the UK and took advice from musicians such as Alexander

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Baird 1963, part 6, pp. 69-74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Programmes from music festivals in Birmingham, Leeds and Bristol in 1880 and 1881 are included in SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/8/1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> SMS 1879c.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Oakeley 1875.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> EUC 1880.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 17 (Minutes of SMS General Meeting, 16 March 1882).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Beyschlag 1882.

Mackenzie.<sup>49</sup> Among the significant figures whom they approached was Max Bruch, but Bruch was loath to leave his post as conductor of the Liverpool Philharmonic Society (1880–3) without financial guarantees.<sup>50</sup> He also had 23 questions for the Society, which are transcribed in Table 1:<sup>51</sup>

# Table 1 Max Bruch, 23 questions

1	Are there in Edinburgh & Glasgow at present efficient but useful <u>orchestral musicians</u> (even if they be not of the first rank), who might eventually be employed in the new orchestra?
2	A list of the same?
3	Is living in Scotland even dearer than living in England? (I heard so!)
4	Would an eventual sum like 1000£ represent in Scotland as much as 800£ in England?
5	Are there already in Edinburgh good teachers for the piano?
6	Dtto [sic] for singing?
7	Dtto [sic] for violin?
8	Who is the best <u>organist</u> in Edinburgh?
9	Have you in Scotland large <u>concert halls</u> and <u>organs</u> therein?
10	What choral societies are there at present in Ed. & Glasgow?
11	Are they of importance in regard to the <u>number of members</u> as well as in regard to <u>artistic performances</u> ?
12	What are the names of their respective conductors?
13	Do there exist in Aberdeen and Dundee and the smaller towns some Choral Societies and what kind of performances do they give?
14	Have these choral societies regular – or only now and then – concerts <u>with or-chestra</u> ?
15	Would these societies eventually bind themselves to employ <u>only</u> – or only <u>partially</u> (now and then) the Edinburgh orchestra? (this is an important point)
16	Are the female voices good in Scotland?
17	And the male voices?
18	Does there, among the more educated population exist a real and sincere liking for good music?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Mackenzie 1882.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Bruch 1882.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> The abbreviations and underlining are in the original. The reply from SMS to Bruch stated that his letter and note were being forwarded to Dr Donaldson, who was at the time in London. SMS 1879b, p. 442 (Letter from from Mr R. Marr, SMS Council secretary, to Max Bruch, 2 August 1882).

Volume 5 (2019)

19	Are those endeavours of the "Council" accompanied by the lively and sincere sympathy of the whole country? And may it be expected with certainty that financial sacrifices (contributions) will be made?
20	Has Edinburgh an opera in winter?
21	What were the programmes of Manns, Bülow and Tausch? I pray you to let me have those programmes.
22	Is it necessary for Edinburgh to look up to London, – as unfortunately the whole of the English provinces must do – or does Scotland, although having lost its political self-dependence still want to go its own way in artistic and literary pursuits as it did formerly? I sincerely hope so and cannot help remembering what an important part formerly the Edinburgh Review has played. (I am reading Carlyle just now with very great pleasure).
23	Does the Italian opera play any conspicuous part in Scotland?

There is no evidence that the Society provided Bruch with any answers.<sup>52</sup> It does, however, give an insight into the lack of understanding of musicians such as Bruch, about musical life in Scotland.<sup>53</sup> The Council was also unable to offer financial guarantees as it was still fundraising at the time, and the financial situation was uncertain.

After consideration of possible candidates for the post of Principal of the new Scottish Academy of Music, the Council agreed to appoint Mr Frederick Hymen Cowen (1852–1935).<sup>54</sup> Cowen accepted this appointment subject to the requisite

Scottish Music Review

Relating to Question 21, it is likely that the SMS council did not have such programmes to pass on. Manns had conducted in Edinburgh in 1867 and 1868 and was back in Scotland in the 1880s and 1890s conducting Paterson orchestral and choral concerts in Glasgow and Edinburgh. Von Bülow had visited Scotland in the 1870s, when he had performed as soloist in the Pianoforte Concerto no. 5 by Beethoven and conducted the first performance in Scotland of the Symphony no. 1 by Brahms in 1877. Tausch, famous as conductor of the Dusseldorf Music Society where he succeeded Schumann, spent a few months in Glasgow in 1878–9: see Wilson 1993, p. 3. Manns, von Bülow and Tausch had conducted the Glasgow Choral Union concerts in the 1870s, so perhaps this was what Bruch remembered. See Farmer 1947, p. 447.

These questions by Bruch appear to confirm Roger Fiske's suggestion that Bruch's interest is Scotland was gleaned from his knowledge of published editions of Scots songs, and that he had not visited Scotland before asking them. Bruch published twelve Scotch songs in 1863, six Schottische Volkslieder in 1876, and his Scottish Fantasia for violin and orchestra was first performed in Berlin in 1880. See Fiske 1983, pp. 177–82.

<sup>54</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 41 (Minutes of the SMS Edinburgh Committee, 13 February 1883). Cowen was a composer, pianist and conductor connected with the principal concert institutions of Great Britain, and with the Crystal Palace Handel Festival amongst others. Frederick Niecks said of him in 1910, in his laureation address on the occasion of the award of Hon. DMus to Frederick Cowen at the University of Edinburgh: The outstanding features that characterise him as a conductor are the soundness of his readings and the catholicity of his taste. As a composer he has successfully displayed his eminent native

funds being achieved, and the Academy established. In his letter, he laid out his terms for a three-year guaranteed appointment at £700 in year one, £800 in year two and £900 in year three. These figures he considered reasonable as he compared them to the £1,000 per annum achieved by Arthur Sullivan at the National Training School.<sup>55</sup> Without further delay, Cowen's name was printed on the publicity material in which he was described as Principal of the Scottish Academy of Music, whose headquarters were to be in Edinburgh. The Society hoped that his commitment to the project would attract the necessary additional financial support, and trusted that the necessary funds would enable operations to commence early in 1883.<sup>56</sup> Cowen's role as Principal of the new Scottish Academy of Music in Edinburgh, as envisaged by the Society, was postponed indefinitely as the Council waited for the funds to pour in.<sup>57</sup>

#### Would the Society ever raise the necessary funds?

The 1880s were a period of falling economic growth on a global scale, beginning around 1879 and continuing into the 1890s, described by some as 'The Long Depression'. <sup>58</sup> By 1885, due to insufficient income from the sales of shares and donations, the Society's plans were again put on hold but, such was the confidence of the members of the Council, they were keen to point out that they 'by no means relinquish the prospect of yet being able to establish a Scottish Academy of Music'. <sup>59</sup> A year later, it was recorded in the minutes: 'the depression of trade still renders it inadvisable to attempt to raise the necessary funds'. <sup>60</sup> The scheme was kept in abeyance, 'so that when suitable opportunity offers it may be ready at once to take the field' and to carry out the objects for which the Society was instituted. <sup>61</sup>

Later in 1886, they were encouraged by evidence in the press of a growth of interest in musical education, and the proposed reforms in the administration of

talents and acquired skill in almost every department of musical composition'. Cowen was born in Jamaica, studied in Britain and Germany, and settled in London in 1868. See Niecks n.d.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Cowen 1882, in which he also mentioned that the payment to Arthur Sullivan was £1,000 per year for five years.

The SMS publicity material stated that 'they [the Council] have the satisfaction of announcing that they have secured the services of the eminent English musician Mr Frederick H. Cowen, as Principal of the Academy'. SMS 1882a.

Meantime, Cowen was busy as conductor of the London Philharmonic Concerts, the Liverpool Philharmonic and, in 1896, succeeded Sir Charles Hallé as conductor of the Hallé Orchestra. In 1900, he came to Scotland as conductor of the Scottish Orchestra. Wilson 1993, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Musson 1959.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 30 (Minutes of the sixth Ordinary Meeting, 13 March 1885).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 36 (Minutes of the seventh Ordinary Meeting, 12 March 1886).

<sup>61</sup> Ibid.

the Reid Bequest and proposals to establish a Faculty of Music at the University of Edinburgh. <sup>62</sup> To take advantage of this interest in musical activities, the Council placed in *The Scotsman* a further notice of the Society's constitution and objects, again to advertise the Society's proposed scheme and attract the financial support of the public. <sup>63</sup> The report to the Ordinary General Meeting in March 1887 quoted an article on the SMS published in November 1886: 'if the Society has a fault, it is its superlative caution; for, on the one hand the Society has publicly announced that it is ready to go on with the Academy scheme at once if the public will give it more money so as to enable it to start on a proper basis; and on the other hand the public hesitates to contribute to a scheme which is not yet in actual working'. <sup>64</sup>

Open to all creative opportunities, the same meeting in 1887 reported that the Council had considered as a revenue stream the success of, and financial surplus attached to, the recent 1886 Edinburgh Inter-national Exhibition. 65 In December 1886, a letter was written to their secretary, outlining the objects of the Society and inviting the Exhibition Association to 'apply this surplus for the promotion of music in Scotland'. 66 Incentives were offered in the form of a 'permanent memorial to the Exhibition' in the new Academy, and a role in the management of the Academy.<sup>67</sup> The activities of the Society were further promoted by their acting secretary and treasurer, Robert Marr, who argued in his book devoted to the musicians participating in the International Exhibition, that 'Scotland, however, requires something more. It wants the power of binding these scattered energies together and of giving them greater national aim and impetus. That power is to be found in the establishment of a Scottish National School of Music'. 68 He also identified and used a quotation from H. R. Haweis: 'When we have a National School of Music, and not before, we shall have high popular standards, and the music of the people will then be as real an instrument of civilisation in its way, and as happily under the control of public opinion, as the Press, the Parliament, or any other of our great national institutions'.<sup>69</sup> These statements made clear the ambitions of the Scottish Musical Society.

<sup>62</sup> W.S. 1886; Unknown 1886a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Unknown 1886c.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> *Ibid.*; SMS 1880b, p. 42 (Minutes of the eighth Ordinary Meeting, 11 March 1887).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> The Edinburgh International Exhibition of Industry, Science & Art ran from the 6 May to the 30 October 1886. See McLean 2013.

SMS 1879a, p. 48 (Letter to James Marchbank, Edinburgh International Exhibition Executive, dated 4 December 1886, drafted at the meeting of the Edinburgh Committee on 15 November 1886); Unknown 1886c.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 49.

<sup>68</sup> Marr 1887, introduction p. xv.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, preface, February 1887; quotation from Haweis 1873, p. 574.

However, by the 1888 meeting, the Society had received no response from the organisers of the International Exhibition, and a year later it was noted that funds had been allocated elsewhere. 70 This was a blow to the Society's ambitions, but the optimism of the Council was still evident when they acknowledged that there had been 'no sufficient change in the state of matters referred to in the report of March 14th 1884 to justify them in recommending that the scheme of the Society be immediately pressed upon the public: at the same time ... the outlook is distinctly brightening ... [so we] propose to keep this matter closely in view'.71

The focus of the Council in the early years was on fundraising and planning for the new Academy. Their plans for a full-time professional resident orchestra in Scotland were given much less attention, perhaps because there were regular orchestral and choral concerts being given in the major cities by amateur organisations and visiting professional artists. With no resident orchestra in Scotland, the Society was concerned that 'some of the principal towns of Scotland have at best but rarely the opportunity of hearing great orchestral works performed and in very many towns such works are never heard adequately rendered'.<sup>72</sup> The new orchestra they were planning would meet this need and provide a service for people across Scotland interested in the performance of quality orchestral music. The Council of the Society was not in favour of the current practice of bringing orchestras from England to perform in Scotland on the grounds that it discouraged resident musicians. 73 The Council was keen to establish an orchestra of local professional musicians and intended that pupils from the new Academy would be drafted into it to encourage and train native musicians in the great masterpieces of orchestral music. An annual series of concerts would be arranged across Scotland to create interest in the objects of the Society, and profits from the concerts would be a 'permanent source of income for the Academy'. 74

After ten years, the Society's members had raised only a few hundred pounds from the sale of shares, subscriptions and donations, after administration, printing and advertising costs and, until the Academy was fully operational, the promised funds, amounting to several thousand pounds, would not be forthcoming.<sup>75</sup> Yet, they were still confident of the future of the Society.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 58 (Minutes of the ninth Ordinary meeting, 9 March 1888).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 64 (Minutes of the tenth Ordinary Meeting, 8 March 1889, including a report of the fifth Ordinary Meeting, 14 March 1884).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> SMS 1882a, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Perhaps in reference to the annual visit of the Hallé Orchestra to Edinburgh to participated in the Edinburgh [Reid] Orchestral Festival each February.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> SMS 1882a, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> SMS n.d.b.

# A different role for the Society

In 1887, another consideration for the Society had been the 'advisability of linking themselves and their academy ... to the system of musical graduation which must ere long replace the present unsatisfying state of things in the University of Edinburgh'. The opportunity for this link came in 1890, with the proposed reforms in the administration of the Reid Chair of Music at the University of Edinburgh being reviewed by the Scottish Universities' Commission. To

Scotland's first Chair of Music had been founded in 1839 in Edinburgh under the terms of the will of General John Reid, a renowned flute player and composer who died in 1807. These terms and the accompanying bequest established the Chair of Music at the University, and a concert in his memory to be held annually in February. After fifty years as a Department of Music within the Faculty of Arts, the University of Edinburgh was planning to create a Faculty of Music with the power to offer, for the first time in Scotland, degrees in Music. The plans coincided with the retirement of Professor Sir Herbert Oakeley, who had long dreamed of the day when music would be recognised as a degree subject. The reforms included the appointment of a new Professor of Music, who would be Dean of the new Faculty of Music, and radical changes to the teaching curriculum.

At a meeting of the Council on 10 February 1890, it was resolved that the Society should formulate a scheme for musical education which would more adequately reflect the Society's interpretation of General Reid's intentions in the context of the musical conditions of the time. It reported: 'The Council has reason for believing that it would be perfectly possible to erect a department within the University for a complete and professional curriculum in Music', <sup>81</sup> and that 'the Reid Endowment within the University of Edinburgh ... might soon, under a reorganised administration, be put in a position to fulfil its true purpose, and thus render an independent Academy unnecessary'. <sup>82</sup>

In March, a detailed memorandum was prepared to be put before the commissioners on the subject of the Reid Endowment, the Chair of Music and on musical education and graduation within the University.<sup>83</sup> The Society was concerned that the original draft ordinance guidelines, put forward by the commissioners, were little more than a paraphrase of the duties of the previous

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> SMS 1880b, pp. 43–4 (Minutes of the SMS ordinary general meeting, 11 March 1887).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 50 (Minutes of SMS Edinburgh Committee Meeting, 10 February 1890).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Field 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Professor Oakeley retired in 1891.

<sup>80</sup> SMS 1890a.

<sup>81</sup> SMS 1879a, p. 50 (Minutes of the Edinburgh Committee Meeting, 10 February 1890).

<sup>82</sup> Donaldson 1913, p. 9.

<sup>83</sup> SMS 1890b (sent in May1890 and published in a supplementary memorandum dated 4 April 1891); a further memorandum was sent by SMS on 22 October 1891.

professor, which the members considered to be insufficient. The Society's draft memorandum offered guidance to the commissioners on how the role of the new Professor of Music could be enhanced to attract the best candidates for the post. The document suggested that a full curriculum could not be provided unless duties be extended over an academic year of approximately 36 weeks, not just a winter session, and that the teaching should be supervised by the professor on both the practical side and the theoretical side to meet the requirements of students of music. It then went on to detail all the Society's ideas and amendments in a five-page document.<sup>84</sup>

This draft was discussed with a deputation from the Edinburgh Society of Musicians, and the document sent to the commissioners in May 1890. <sup>85</sup> The Scottish Musical Society was subsequently invited to make an oral presentation on its draft memorandum. <sup>86</sup> The deliberations and decisions of the commissioners in the matter of the reforms to the Chair of Music, and the contribution of the Society in showing that 'the advocacy of a complete Music School in the University' would be practicable with funds from the Reid Bequest, were eagerly anticipated. <sup>87</sup>

It is unclear how the Council thought this link would benefit the finances of the Society, if at all, although through their efforts they may have hoped to attract attention to the ambitions of the Society. It may have been that the Council was hoping to join forces with the University in the setting up of a Music School in the University of Edinburgh. They included in their recommendations to the commissioners their estimates of income and expenditure based on an attendance of 50 pupils and using some of the University's own figures.<sup>88</sup>

Not content with writing to the Scottish Universities' Commission, in April 1891 the Society wrote to the Edinburgh University Court drawing attention to the Scottish Musical Society's detailed scheme for the reorganisation of the Chair that had been sent to the commissioners. <sup>89</sup> In October 1891, the Society wrote once again to the University Court, this time commenting on the inconvenience of appointing a new Professor of Music, Mr Frederick Niecks, before it was clear what he was to do, and while the Scottish Universities' Commissioners Draft Ordinance was still under discussion. Similar representations were also made to the commissioners by the Edinburgh Society of Professional Musicians and by

<sup>84</sup> Ibid.

<sup>85</sup> Unknown 1890a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 127–45 (Minutes of the SMS Ordinary meeting on 26 March 1891).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Unknown 1890b.

<sup>88</sup> SMS 1891, 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> SMS 1879a (Minutes of the Sub-Committee of the SMS Edinburgh Committee, 7 April 1891 [loose enclosure]).

the General Council of the University of Edinburgh.<sup>90</sup> The Society's wish was that, before an appointment was made, the outlines for the scheme of teaching should be made clear, and that the focus should be on teaching and not simply on graduations.

The first part of this wish was not achieved, but in appointing Niecks, recognised for his writings on music and his background in music history and theory, to the Chair of Music at the University of Edinburgh in 1891, the recommendations of the commissioners went some way to meeting the requirement for a focus on teaching. The scheme of teaching was for the new professor to negotiate with the university authorities, and not something which could be outlined in advance of the appointment. It may be that the Society's 'objections and amendments' to the Draft Ordinance were influential in aspects of the appointment to the Chair of Music, as the commissioners would have wished to be seen as taking account of public opinion. However, it was perhaps ambitious of the Society to think that it could persuade the commissioners to establish a Music Academy in the University of Edinburgh.

The University protected its position to establish a Faculty of Music based on the art and science of the theory of music, and at the Society's Ordinary General Meeting in March 1893 it was recorded that the Scottish Universities' Commissioners had published their final Ordinance on the Music Chair and the Draft Ordinance on Graduation in Music. The SMS Council was disappointed that no 'thoroughgoing alteration' to Music teaching had been made, but they approved of the scheme for Graduation in Music.<sup>91</sup> By 1894, the Ordinances had passed into law.<sup>92</sup>

The Society now returned to consider the future of its organisation and its original ambitions to establish an Academy of Music in Edinburgh and a permanent orchestra for Scotland. Despite its continued enthusiasm and best intentions to attract support and funding over the years from 1894 and 1897, it became clear that no such schemes would be taken forward. Perhaps the new Faculty of Music at the University had usurped their plans, and the need for an Academy such as had been proposed in 1879 was less urgent. At the Ordinary General Meeting on 5 March 1897, the decision was taken that the Society 'should now be dissolved', and one year later, on 17 March 1898, the nineteenth Ordinary meeting of the Society, held at 30 Hanover Street, confirmed the voluntary

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> SMS 1880b, p. 144 (Minutes of the thirteenth Ordinary Meeting, 11 March 1892, including a letter to John Christison, Secretary, University Court, dated 7 October 1891); Unknown 1890c; SMS 1891, 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> SMS 1880b, p.150 (Minutes of the Ordinary General Meeting, 10 March 1893).

<sup>92</sup> SUC 1893. Commissioners' Ordinances under the Universities (Scotland) Act, 1889, as laid before parliament which may come into operation on 1st October 1893. Ordinance no. 34. [Edinburgh, no. 8 – regulations for degrees in music], Calendar 1893–94. Above ordinance. Approved by Her Majesty in Council on 29 January 1894.

resolution, that the company be wound up.<sup>93</sup> The Academy of Music for Scotland as envisaged by the founders of the Society never opened, and they never achieved their wish to form a full-time, permanent orchestra for Scotland.<sup>94</sup>

#### The legacy

In 1900, the Society was formally wound up by voluntary liquidation. The Report by Liquidator to Shareholders of the Scottish Musical Society was dated 27 February 1900 and included a list of the books and scores bought, on the recommendation of Professor Niecks, and handed over to the University of Edinburgh, in terms of the Resolution adopted by the Shareholders (see Appendix 1).

The list of books purchased in 1900 was an interesting mix and many are still today on the open shelves in the Edinburgh University Library. <sup>95</sup> Each has inside a small printed label, as illustrated in Figure 1.



Figure 1 Scottish Musical Society Book Plate

The four important legacies of the Society can be summarized as follows: raising awareness of the lack of facilities for musical education in Scotland; raising awareness of the need for a resident orchestra in Scotland; contribution to the discussions relating to the reorganisation of the Chair of Music at the University of Edinburgh and the establishment of a Faculty of Music in 1893–4; and the provision of funds for the purchase of books and scores for the Music Class Room Library in the University of Edinburgh.

The vision of the men who set up the Scottish Musical Society in 1879 was a worthy one, and the endeavour had the potential to be a successful venture at a time of growing public participation in music across Scotland. Amateur orchestras and choral societies were established in Edinburgh in the late nineteenth

\_

<sup>93</sup> SMS 1880b, p.185 (Minutes of the thirteenth Ordinary Meeting): voluntary resolution passed at the SMS Extra-ordinary General Meeting on 24 February 1898. Alexander Wood Inglis, John Kirkhope and William Cowan were appointed liquidators; see SMS 1898)

<sup>94</sup> Scotland had to wait until the 1950s for a full-time professional orchestra to be established. The Scottish National Orchestra was founded in Glasgow on 8 July 1950. Wilson 1993, p. 60.

<sup>95</sup> See note 111

century and were presenting performances in the city. In 1867, Professor Oakeley had started the Edinburgh University Musical Society Orchestra, and a few years later added a chorus. In May 1872, the Edinburgh Amateur Orchestral Society was instituted under the leadership of Professor Oakeley for the 'practice and performance of Classical Music'. This orchestra met weekly during the winter months, gave three concerts annually, and its membership included many graduates and alumni of the University of Edinburgh. 96 Members of this organisation frequently provided orchestral assistance at concerts given by the Edinburgh University Musical Society orchestra and chorus, and at concerts given by other choral societies in the city. Two other leading organisations for the promotion of music in Edinburgh were set up around this time: the Edinburgh Society of Musicians in 1887, and on 13 March 1889 the first meeting of the Edinburgh Bach Society was held in the North British Hotel (now the Balmoral Hotel). 97

Professional concerts in the city included the University's Reid Concerts, presented annually in February by Professor Oakeley and given by the Hallé Orchestra from 1869 to 1891.98 The Choral Union in Edinburgh, established in 1858, introduced a winter series of orchestral concerts in 1874, and when in 1887 the Choral Union committee was forced, for financial reasons, to give up the winter orchestral series, the firm of Paterson Sons and Co. took over the organisation of the concerts. 99 The 'Paterson orchestral concerts' developed into a winter series of 12 concerts presented on Monday evenings from October to March, and the organisers always invited the Edinburgh Choral Union to participate in at least one of the series. This series ran from 1887 until 1931, with a short break for three years during the Great War, and it was continued from 1931 to 1939 by the Edinburgh Concert Society. 100

In Glasgow, the Atheneum which in 1888 moved to new premises in St George's Place, had by 1890 developed into the new Atheneum School of Music, and in 1891 The Scottish Orchestra had been established. 101 This part-time professional orchestra developed from the group of musicians in Glasgow which was formerly known as the orchestra that played for concerts given by the Glasgow Choral Union. The newly named Scottish Orchestra was funded by a donation of £20,000 from wealthy west-coast ship owner, James A. Allan, and its first concert in 1893 was conducted by George Henschel. 102 The Scottish Orchestra's

Scottish Music Review Volume 5 (2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> EAOS 1872.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> ESM n.d.; EBS 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Donaldson 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> ERCU 1958, p. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Programmes 1887; Paterson, Sons' & Co. (Music sellers to the Queen) also presented a series of orchestral and choral concerts in Glasgow, Dundee and Kirkcaldy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Farmer 1947, p. 398.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Wilson 1993, p. 4; George Henschel was also a well-known bass singer and was previously conductor of the Boston Symphony Orchestra.

first two leaders were not Scots but the French violinist Maurice Sons (1891–1903) and the Belgian violinist Henri Verbrugghen (1903–14). Frederick Cowen did bring his musical talents to Scotland when he was appointed conductor of the Scottish Orchestra in Glasgow from 1900 to 1910. His appointment coincided with the winding-up of the Scottish Musical Society in 1900. It would be nearly thirty years before the Scottish National Academy of Music and the Chair of Music at the University of Glasgow were founded. Music are some content of Music and the University of Glasgow were founded.

As one door closed others briefly opened. In 1900, Professor Niecks, the new Dean of the Faculty of Music at the University of Edinburgh, gave an address with a view to the formation of a society for the promotion of musical education and culture. This society, he envisaged, was intended for both professional musicians and students as a 'mutual improvement society', each contributing his or her quota to the general fund of knowledge. There is no indication that this society was ever active, but Professor Niecks may have used some of the ideas from this address in his teaching at the Faculty of Music.

The following year, Niecks gave a lecture entitled 'A Music School for Scotland' in which he again raised the subject of the lack of such an institution in Scotland. He gave an account of his ideas for such a music school, what it could achieve and how it could be realised. His scheme would cost a great deal of money and could never be self-supporting. Adequate funding for suitable facilities, payment of staff and working expenses could be met in part by Government or local councils, but the main support, he said, must come from private sources. He asked, 'is there not a patriotic Scotchman, or number of Scotchmen who will give us the pecuniary means that would enable us to form a school of music where all that the composer, performer and teacher requires shall be taught, and taught methodically and thoroughly?'. 107 A few years later, the Corporation of Edinburgh looked again at a College of Music for the City. Marjorie Kennedy Fraser, a former music student at the University of Edinburgh, wrote an article debating aspects of the topic in *The Blue Blanket* in 1912. 109 In 1914, public meetings were held in Edinburgh and a draft constitution was published, but it is likely

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Wilson 1993, p. 188.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Wilson 1993, p. 187.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> The Scottish National Academy of Music, which was founded in 1929 and is now known as the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, developed from the Atheneum School of Music in Glasgow (1890). The Gardiner Chair of Music at the University of Glasgow was endowed in 1928 by William Guthrie Gardiner. See RCS 2014; Unknown n.d.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Niecks n.d. (Address to a Meeting of Edinburgh Music Teachers, 31 January 1900).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> *Ibid*. Introductory lecture by Professor Niecks, delivered in the University of Edinburgh on October 14, 1901.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Unknown 1913.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Kennedy-Fraser 1912.

that the outbreak of war put paid to any plans, and the discussions were put on hold indefinitely. 110

On 6 November 1911, The Dunedin Association was constituted in Edinburgh to 'protest against the indifference shown to Scottish Music and Poetry'. 111 The membership attracted those interested in the establishment of a Scottish school of musical utterance, and their ambition was to promote the development of Scottish music in accordance with the development of musical science. The composer Hamish MacCunn wrote an article in 1913 entitled 'A Scottish College of Music', pointing out the expense of studying abroad: although London was cheaper than Germany, 'the only thinkable remedy ... is to establish a National College of Music in Edinburgh'. 112 He noted that 'since 1883, the population of Scotland has increased by over one million, and that the country itself has produced a million reasons for the coming into being of her own National College of Music'. 113

Dr Donaldson, by now Professor Sir James Donaldson, Principal of the University of St Andrews, and a member of the Dunedin Association Council, replied in an article in November 1913, entitled 'A Scottish Academy of Music for Scotland', giving the readers some background on the activities of the Scottish Musical Society and pointing out some of the challenges they had faced. 114 Despite the demise of the Society he had started in 1879, he agreed with MacCunn that Scotland needed an Academy of Music in Scotland, and was interested in forming a committee to help establish it. He was encouraged by the success of the new School of Music in Dunfermline which had been established by the Carnegie Trust of Dunfermline; it had thirty teachers giving instrumental instruction and had spent, on teaching and concerts, a total of £4,779, 18s 3d in the previous year. A new Academy of Music for Scotland could perhaps be built along similar lines. 115 The Dunedin Association's support for a proposed Music School for Scotland was interrupted by the Great War. 116

The Scottish Musical Society had worthy ambitions in a time of great change, entrepreneurship and enterprise, but perhaps the Society lacked the guidance of professional musicians to achieve the goals of setting up a Scottish Academy of Music and a resident orchestra in Scotland. The Society started with a written constitution and tried to make it work rather than giving serious consideration to working with music schools and teachers across Scotland to building an Academy of Music for Scotland from already established foundations. Their ambitious

<sup>111</sup> Dunedin Association 1912.

Scottish Music Review Volume 5 (2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> CE 1914.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> MacCunn 1913, p. 154.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> MacCunn 1913, p. 155.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Donaldson 1913, pp. 5–10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Donaldson 1913, p. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Oates 2013, pp. 213–18.

plans would also have benefitted from a major benefactor willing to contribute, not only to the improvement of practical music provision in Scotland but also to the morals, musical culture and tastes of the Scottish people.

There is nothing in the papers of the Scottish Musical Society to suggest why the Society attracted such limited support over the years. The Council was, as previously mentioned, a group of academics and businessmen and they did their best to attract funding from their peers and the general public, but there is little evidence that they used the skills of local musicians and music teachers in pursuit of their cause. Their focus was on the establishment of an Academy in Edinburgh, and they neglected their promise to develop plans for a resident orchestra in Scotland or to organise concerts, as had been laid out in the constitution. The men behind the Society failed to attract sufficient funds to achieve their ambitions, but they left a lasting legacy which can be seen in the form of books and scores in Edinburgh University Library. 117

#### Appendix 1

*Transcribed by the author from the original document of 1900* 

Report by the liquidator to the shareholders of the Scottish Musical Society in liquidation 1900

Robert A. Marr, liquidator

The liquidator has now to submit to the shareholders the account of charge and discharge, showing his intromissions during the liquidation.

It will be remembered that, in passing the special resolution to wind up the society by voluntary liquidation, the following extract from the council's annual report, which was unanimously adopted at the annual meeting of shareholders, was referred to:

That in their opinion, the society, having accomplished all that is possible with the means at its disposal, should now be dissolved. With that end in view the council recommend that the necessary steps be taken to have the society wound up by voluntary liquidation; that Robert Alexander Marr, Accountant, Edinburgh, be appointed Liquidator; and that Alexander Wood Inglis, John Kirkhope, Jr., and William Cowan be appointed a Committee to advise with the Liquidator. Further, to meet the requirements of the 9<sup>th</sup> clause of the Memorandum of the Association, which specifies that 'if upon the winding up or dissolution of the Society their remains, after the satisfaction of all its debts and liabilities, any property whatsoever, the same shall not be paid of distributed among the members of the Society but shall be given or transferred to some other institution or institutions, having objects similar to the objects of the Society, at or before the time of dissolution', they recommend that after all the Society's debts and expenses of the liquidation

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> SMS 1900.

are met, the balance in the hands of the Liquidator shall be expended by him, with the advice of the Committee, in the purchase of books for presentation to the University of Edinburgh for the purposes of the Music Class Room Library in connection with the Reid Chair of Music'.

In selecting music books for purchase for the Music Class Room Library, University of Edinburgh, the Liquidator and his Committee were in constant communication with Professor Niecks, the holder of the Reid Chair of Music, and no books were purchased for the Library before they received the approval of the Professor. This has involved much time and thought, as Professor Niecks was naturally desirous of acquiring such books as would prove of value to the students, and which could not be got as every-day additions to the Library.

The Catalogues of various booksellers and publishers in this country and on the continent were carefully watched, and from time to time, books were selected that appeared to be appropriate to the gift. In all, 179 volumes have been purchased, principally from Reeves, London; Liepmannsohn, Berlin; Schott & Co., Frankfurt; Fuerstner, Berlin, Aibl, Leipsic; Novello, Ewer & Co, London; Philip Macquet, Paris; Leuckhart, Leipsic; C.F.W. Siegel, Leipsic; Harold & Co., London; Breitokopf & Haertel, Leipsic; and Elliot, Methven Simpson & Co, Glen, Oliphant Anderson and Ferrier, and Willians & Nordgate, Edinburgh. The cost of these volumes has been £155:8:-. The dearest purchase was the Full Orchestral scores of the following operas of Richard Wagner: Tannhauser, Lohengrin, Die Meistersinger, Tristan and Isolde, Parsifal, Rienzi and the Flying Dutchman. These cost £71:10:-. [Appendix 2 gives a complete list of the volumes purchased. Each volume bears a printed label containing the wording, 'Presented to the Music Class Room Library, University of Edinburgh, by Scottish Musical Society, on its Dissolution in 1900'].

Robt. A Marr 30 Hanover Street, Edinburgh 27<sup>th</sup> February, 1900

#### **Appendix 2**

This has been transcribed as it was typed in 1900. No attempt has been made to reorder it or to divide it into sections.

The Scottish Musical Society

List of books handed over to the University of Edinburgh for the purposes of the Music Class Room Library in connection with the Reid Chair of Music, in terms of Resolution adopted by the Shareholders.

Cyclopedia of Music and Musicians, edited by John Denison Champlin, Jr. 3 volumes

Cathedral Music, being a Collection in Score of the Most Valuable and Useful Compositions for that Service by the Several English Masters of the last 200 years. 3 volumes. Revised by Dr Arnold.

Cathedral Music, a Collection in Score of the Most Valuable and Useful Compositions for that Service by the Several English Masters of the last 200 years. Volume II, revised by Dr Wm. Boyce

Wit and Mirth, or Pills to Purge Melancholy, being a collection of the best Merry Ballads and Songs, Old and New. By Thos. D'Urfey. 6 vols.

Principles de la Musique et Methode de Transposition. By Augustin Savard.

Student's Handbook of Acoustics, by John Broadhouse.

Reeves' Vamping Tutor. The Art of Extemporaneous Accompaniment or Playing by Ear on the Pianoforte. By Francis Taylor

Twelve Analysed Fugues with Double Counterpoints in all Intervals, and Introductory Explanations, for Two Performers on One Pianoforte, by A.F.C. Kollmann

The Art of Tuning the Pianoforte, by Hermann Smith

Harper's School for the Trumpet.

Catalogo della Biblioteca des Liceo Musicale di Bologna. by Gaetano Caspari, 3 vols.

Cenni Storico-Critici intorno alla vita ed alle opera di Gio. Adolfo Hassedetto il Sassone.

Delle opera di Alessandro Stradella estistenti nell' archive musicale della R. bibliot. Palatina di Modena.

Wagner, Richard, Full Score of Tannhauser

Lohengrin

Die Meistersinger Tristan and Isolde

Wagner, Richard, Full Score of Parsifal

Rienzi

The Flying Dutchman

Strauss, Richard, Full Score of Aus Italien

Macbeth

Tod und Verklarung

Till Eulenspiegels lustige Streiche

Also sprach Zarathustra

Ein Heldenleben

Mackenzie, A.C., Vocal Score Rose of Sharon

Dream of Jubal Story of Sayid

lason

Bethlehem

Columba

The Troubadour

Cowan, Frederick H

Vocal Score Ruth

Thorgrim
St John's Eve
Sleeping Beauty

Bridge, Frederick, Vocal Score Callirhoe
Crotch, William, Vocal Score Palestine

Bennett, W. Sterndale

Vocal Score Woman of Samaria

May Queen

Sullivan, Arthur, Vocal Score The Golden Legend

Tempest

Smart, Henry, Vocal Score Bridge of Dunkerron

Barnby, Joseph, Vocal Score Rebekah

Barnett, John F., Vocal Score Ancient Mariner

Paradise and the Peri

Macfarren, G.A. Vocal Score May Day

**Outward Bound** 

Parry, C.H.H. Vocal Score Judith

King Saul

Stanford C. Villiers Vocal Score Eden

Voyage of Maldune

Stainer, John, Vocal Score Daughter of Jairus

Crucifixion

St Cecilia's Hall in the Niddry Wynd. By David Fraser Harris

Musical Haunts in London. By F.G.Edwards

The Glen Collection of Scottish Dance Music, Strathspeys, Reels, and Jigs, Arranged with New Accompaniments for the Pianoforte. By John Glen. Books I and II

Hector Berlioz, Full Score of Messe des Mortes

Full Score of Te Deum

Grande Symphonie Fantastique (par F. Liszt) for piano

Liszt, Fr., Full Score of Todtentanz

Studies, Etc., for the Pianoforte

Rhapsodies Hungroises, pour Piano

Beethoven, L. van Symphonien, (for Pianoforte), Bulow-Liszt

Life of George Thomson. By J. Cuthbert Hadden

The Organs of Speech. By G.H. von Meyer

The Scottish Hymnal, With Tunes

The Church Hymnary. Edited by Sir John Stainer

The Orchestra, and How to Write for it. By F. Corder

Macfarren, G.A., Vocal Score of St. John the Baptist

The Lady of the Lake

Selection of Practical Harmony for the Organ or Pianoforte, containing Voluntaries, Fugues, Canons, and other Ingenious Pieces, by the most Eminent Composers, edited by Clementi, 4 volumes

The Music Dramas of Richard Wagner and his Festival Theatre in Bayreuth. By Albert Lavignac. Translated from the French by Esther Singleton

The Music and Musical Instruments of Southern India. By C.R. Day

Short History of Military Music. By J.A. Kappey

Studies in Modern Music, 2 volumes. By W.H. Hadow

The History of Mendelssohn's Oratorio, Elijah. By F.G.Edwards

Helpful Papers for Harmony Students. By Henry C. Banister

Tristan and Isolde, by Richard Wagner, explained according to the Musical Motives. By Albert Heintz, translated by Constance Bache.

Parsifal, by Richard Wagner, explained according to the Musical Motives. By Albert Heintz, translated by Constance Bache.

The Meister-Singers of Nuremberg, by Richard Wagner, a musical explanation with numerous Musical Examples. By Albert Heintz, translated by Constance Bache.

An Interpretation of Wagner's Niebelungen Ring. By Freda Winworth

A Few Words to Candidates for the Degree of Mus. Bac., Oxon. By John Stainer

Cathedral Organists, Past and Present. By John E. West

Traite Pratique d'Instrumentation. Par Ernest Guiraud

The Literature of Music. By James E. Matthew

The Autobiography of Karl von Dittersdorf. Translated by A.D.Coleridge

Musical Scotland, Past and Present. By David Baptie

Jenny Lind. A Record and Analysis of the 'Method' of the late Madame Jenny Lind-Goldschmidt. By W.S.Rockstro

The Troubadours and Courts of Love. By John Frederick Rowbotham

The History of the Pianoforte, with an Account of the Theory of Sound and also of the Music and Musical Instruments of the Ancients. By Edgar Brinsmead

Sketches of the English Glee Composers Historical, Biographical and Critical. By David Baptie

Catalogue of the Library of the Sacred Harmony Society

The Deppe Finger Exercises for rapidly developing an Artistic Touch in Piano Forte Playing, arranged, classified and explained by Amy Fay.

Six Lectures on Harmony, by G.A. Macfarren

The Material used in Musical Composition. By Percy Goetschius

Sonatea Violino Solo e Basso Continuo de Sig. Tomazo Albinoni, e uno Suario o Capriccio del Sig. Tibaldi

The Padlock, a Comic Opera, as it is performed at the Theatre Royal in Drury Lane. The music by Mr Dibdin.

Solos for a German Flute or Violin with a Thorough Bass for the Harpsichord or Bass Violin, composed by Pietro Locatelli

Het Stade-Muziekcollegie te Utrecht (Collegium Musicum Ultrajectinum), 1631-1881. Door J.G.M.van Riemsdjik

The Whole Book of Psalms, with the Tunes in Four Parts. By Thomas Este

Studio di Musica Teorica Practica containing sketches of Harmony, etc. By G.G.Ferrari

Der Tod Jesu, Kantate, vo C.H. Graun

Hamilton's Catechism on the Art of Writing for an Orchestra, and on Playing from a Score.

Selection of Sacred Music from the Works of Some of the Most Eminent Composers. By C.J.Latrobe, 4 volumes

Memoir of Madame Jenny Lind-Godschmidt: Her Early Art-Life and Dramatic Career, 1820-1851. By H.S. Holland and W.S. Rockstro. 2 Vols.

First Set of Madrigals for Three, Four, Five and Six Voices . Composed by John Wilbye.

Borodin and Liszt. I. Life and Works of a Russian Composer. II. Liszt, as sketched in the Letters of Borodin. By Alfred Habets. Translated with a Preface by Ross Newmarch.

English Operas. By William Shield. 'Richard Coeur de Lion', 'Robin Hood', 'Fontainebleu', 'The Nunnery', 'The Lock and Key', 'Siege of Gibraltar', 'Flitch of Bacon', 'Omai, or a Trip Round the World', 'Hartford Bridge', 'Poor Soldier', 'Love in A Camp', 'The Farmer', 'Rosina', 'The Choleric Fathers', 'The Crusade', 'The Highland Reel or Musical Romance', 'The Woodman'. 17 works in 3 volumes. (These books were formerly the property of J.B.Maidment, The celebrated Antiquarian and Book Collector.)

The Letters of a Leisig Cantor, being the Letters of Moritz Hauptmann to F. Hauser, Ludwig Spohr, and other musicians. Edited by Alfred Schone and Ferdinand Hiller. Translated by A.D. Coleridge. 2 Vols.

A Catechism of Harmony, Thorough-Bass, and Modulation. By John Hiles.

The Life and Works of the Chevalier Noverre. Edited by C.E.Noverre.

Orphee aux Enfers, Opera Bouffon. by J. Offenbach.

Harmonia Sacra or Select Anthems in Score for one, two and three Voices. Compos'd by the late Mr Henry Purcell.

Thesaurus Musicus. A Collection of two, three and four part Songs etc., Revis'd, corrected and figur'd by a Judisious Master.

Sechs Quartette fur 2 Violinen, Viola, and Violoncello. Von Carl Ditters von Dittersdorf. Enclosed in a Special Made Cover.

Life of Chopin, by Franz Liszt. Translated for the first time by J. Broadhouse

XII. Sonatas for Two Violins with a Through Bass for the Harpsichord. Composed by J.S. Humphries.

A Short History of Cheap Music as exemplified in the Records of the House of Novello, Ewer, & Co with especial reference to the first fifty years of the Reign of Her Most Gracious Majesty Queen Victoria. Preface by Sir George Grove.

Student and Singer. The Reminiscences of Charles Santley

Francois Liszt: Recollections of a Compatriot. Translated from the French of Janka Wohl by B. Peyton Ward.

La Dame Blanche. Opera Comique en trois actes. Paroles de Nr. Scribe. Mis en Musicque par A. Boildieu. (Orchestral Score)

Jean de Paris. Opera Comique in deux Actes. Paroles de M.de St. Just. Partition d'Orchestre. Par A. Boildieu.

Elsner, Joseph.

- 1. Alleluja Juravit Dominus. 2. Offertorium: Quoniam in me Speravit. 3. Offertorium Cantantibus organis. 4. Offertorium: Expectans expectavi dominum.
- 1. Hymnus: Veni Creator, per 4 voces. 2. Missa Musicam Vocibus humanis exercendum. 3. Psalmus: De Profundis Clamavi. 4. Marcia Funebre, fur Orchester. 5. Salve Regina, fur Chor mit Orchester. 6. Requiem, fur Chor mit Orchester.

Missa, quatuor vocibus humanis Orchest. In Stimmen

Missa, quatuor vocibus humanis comitante orchestra. In Stimmen

Motet fur Doppelchoir: Gloria et honore coronasti Eum. 2. Hymne: Veni Sancte Spiritus, fur Chor mit Orchester. 3. Hymnus Ambrosianus fur Chor mit Orchester.

Offertorium: Confirma hoc Deus. Fur Chor mit Orchester In Stimmen.

Fernand Cortez, ou La Conquete du Mexique. Tragedie lyrique en trois actes. Mise en Musique par G. Spontini

La Vestale. Tragedie lyrique en trois actes. Mise en Musique par G Spontini

L'Art du Chant: Opinions sur les Chanteurs anciens et modernes. Par Tosi

Anthologie Francoise, ou Chansons choisies depuis de 13e Siecle jusqu' a present. 3 Vols.

Choix de Chansons Joyeuses. Supplement to the last Work.

Musique des Chansons de Beranger; Aires notes ancient et modernes.

Chansons populaires Russes (Pesni Russkago naroda)

Chants et Chansons Populaires du Printemps et de l'Ete. Par J.B. Wekerlin. 2 Vols.

Echoes du temps passé transcrits avec Accompagnement de Piano par J.B. Wekerlin. 2 Vols.

Memoirs pour server a l'histoire de la Revolution operee dans la Musique Par M. le Chevalier Gluck.

Harmony: Chordal and Contrapuntal. By Henry Hiles.

How to Listen to Music. Hints and Suggestions to untaught Lovers of the Art. By Henry Edward Krehbiel.

Harmony or Counterpoin? By Henry Hiles.

Technique and Expression in Pianoforte Playing. By Franklin Taylor.

The Grammar of Music. A Treatise on Harmony, Counterpoint and Form. By Henry Hiles. 2 Volumes.

Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienen Werke von Fr. Schubert. Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienen Werke F. Chopin Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienen Werke Mendelssohn Thematisches Verzeichniss der im Druck erschienen Werke Beethoven

Autobiographical Reminiscences of Charles Gounod, With Family Letters and Notes on Music. From the French by the Hon. W. Hely Hutchinson.

Early Scottish Melodies. By John Glen

### **Bibliography**

Records of the Scottish Musical Society (SMS) are held by Edinburgh University Library (EUL), Special Collections, Main Library, George Square, Edinburgh, ref: EUA CRC Coll-1385.

Baird 1963: George Baird, 'Edinburgh Theatres, Cinemas and Circuses, 1820–1963 [the typescript of an unpublished work]' 4 vols (Edinburgh: 1963). Cited in note(s) 42

Beyschlag 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Beyschlag-Bundle1882: Letters and Documentation from A. Beyschlag, 1882. Cited in note(s) 48

Bruch 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1882: Letter with accompanying questions from Max Bruch to Mr R. Marr, SMS Council secretary, July 1882. Cited in note(s) 50

CE 1914: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/8/4: Extracts from Corporation of Edinburgh Minutes of Public Meeting and of Meetings of Committees and Corporation of Edinburgh, 1914. Cited in note(s) 110

- Corporation of Edinburgh 1914: Corporation of Edinburgh, *Draft Constitution of the Edinburgh College of Music* (Edinburgh: H. & J. Pillans & Wilson, 1914).
- Cowen 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1882: Letter from Frederick Cowen to Mr T. L. Stillie, SMS Council member, 3 August 1882. Cited in note(s) 55
- Craik 2004: Elizabeth Craik, 'Donaldson, Sir James (1831–1915), Educationist and Classical and Patristic Scholar', *Dictionary of National Biography* (2004): http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/32856 (accessed 13 December 2015). Cited in note(s) 7
- Distin 1857: National Archives of Scotland, GD 112/11/10/15/15: Letter from John Distin to the Marquis of Breadalbane concerning his Proposed Farewell Concert at Exeter Hall, London. Cited in note(s) 22
- Donaldson 1913: James Donaldson, 'A Scottish Academy of Music for Scotland', *The Dunedin Magazine* (November 1913): 5–10. Cited in note(s) 10, 27, 82, 114, 115
- Donaldson 2015: Fiona M. Donaldson, 'Reid Concerts: Concerts in the University of Edinburgh from 1841', University of Edinburgh (2015): http://www.reidconcerts.music.ed.ac.uk (accessed 10 December 2015). Cited in note(s) 18, 98
- Dunedin Association 1912: The Dunedin Association, 'Prospectus and Constitution of the Association', *The Dunedin Magazine*, 1/1 (1912): 24. Cited in note(s) 111
- EAOS 1872: 'Minute book of the Edinburgh Amateur Orchestral Society (1872–1955)], in the personal possession of Professor A. Myers, Edinburgh. Cited in note(s) 96
- EBS 2015: [Author unknown], 'The history of the Edinburgh Bach Society (est. 1889) and Choir (est. 1910)', Edinburgh Bach Society (2015): http://www.edinburghbachchoir.org.uk/our-history/ (accessed 13 December 2015). Cited in note(s) 97
- ERCU 1958: [Duncan Ballantine], *The Centenary of the Edinburgh Royal Choral Union, 1858–1958* (Edinburgh: Privately printed by T. and A. Constable, 1958). Cited in note(s) 99

- ESM n.d.: [Author unknown], 'Edinburgh Society of Musicians', The Edinburgh Society of Musicians (n.d.): http://www.edinburghsocietyofmusicians.co.uk/ (accessed 20 October 2014). Cited in note(s) 97
- EUC 1880: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, EUA.P.1.: *Edinburgh University Calendar* (1879–80). Cited in note(s) 46
- Farmer 1947: Henry George Farmer, *A History of Music in Scotland* (London: Hinrichsen Edition, 1947). Cited in note(s) 1, 4, 52, 101
- Field 2004: Christopher D. S. Field, 'Reid [Formerly Robertson], John (1722?–1807), Army Officer and Composer', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (2004): http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/ 23331 (accessed 13 December 2015). Cited in note(s) 78
- Fiske 1983: Roger Fiske, *Scotland in Music: A European Enthusiasm* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983). Cited in note(s) 53
- Golding 2013: Rosemary Golding, *Music and Academia in Victorian Britain* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013). Cited in note(s) 1
- Haweis 1873: H. R. Haweis, *Music and Morals*, 3rd edn (London: Strahan, 1873): 573–4. Cited in note(s) 69
- Hullah 1880: John Hullah, 'Annual Report for the Year 1879', *The Musical Monthly Record* (October 1880): 131–2. Cited in note(s) 9
- Kennedy-Fraser 1912: Marjorie Kennedy-Fraser, 'The Proposed Music School for Scotland', *The Blue Blanket: An Edinburgh Civic Review*, 1/1 (1912): 28–35. Cited in note(s) 109
- MacCunn 1913: Hamish MacCunn, 'A Scottish College of Music', *The Dunedin Magazine* (May 1913): 153–8. Cited in note(s) 112, 113
- Mackenzie 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1882: Letter from A. C. Mackenzie to John Kirkhope, SMS Council member, July 1882. Cited in note(s) 49
- Mackenzie 1927: Alexander Campbell Mackenzie, *A Musician's Narrative* (London and Toronto: Cassell, 1927). Cited in note(s) 17

- Marr 1887: Robert Alexander Marr, *Music and Musicians at the Edinburgh Inter*national Exhibition, 1886 (Edinburgh: Constable, 1887). Cited in note(s) 68, 69
- McLean 2013: David McLean, 'Lost Edinburgh: Edinburgh International Exhibition 1886', *The Scotsman* (15 April 2013): http://www.scotsman.com/heritage/people-places/lost-edinburgh-edinburgh-international-exhibition-1886-1-2895307 (accessed 24 October 2014). Cited in note(s) 65
- Musson 1959: A. E. Musson, 'The Great Depression in Britain, 1873–1896: A Reappraisal', *The Journal of Economic History*, 19/2 (1959): 199–228. Cited in note(s) 58
- Oates 2013: Jennifer Oates, *Hamish MacCunn (1868–1916): A Musical Life*, Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013). Cited in note(s) 116
- Niecks n.d.: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, Coll-1086 E2006.10: Papers of Frederick Niecks]. Cited in note(s) 54, 106, 107
- Oakeley 1875: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections CLX-A-969, Da 46.11: Professor Oakeley's Concert Accounts for Reid Concert 1875. Cited in note(s) 45
- Oakeley 1880: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1880: Letter from Professor Oakeley to Mr R. Marr, SMS Council secretary, 30 January 1880. Cited in note(s) 20
- Oakeley 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1882: Letter from Professor Oakeley to Mr W. Cowan, SMS Council member, 16 March 1882. Cited in note(s) 23
- Programmes 1887: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, [no shelf mark]: Paterson & Sons' Orchestral Concerts and Edinburgh Concert Society concert programmes (1887–1939). Cited in note(s) 100
- Paterson & Sons' Orchestral Concerts (Edinburgh) 1887–1931: Edinburgh University Library Special Collections [no shelfmark]: Concert Programmes 1887–1931.
- RCS 2014: [Author unknown], 'History', Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (2014): https://www.rcs.ac.uk/about\_us/aboutus/history/ (accessed 15 July 2015). Cited in note(s) 105

- Rosebery 1881: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1881 [in date order]: Letter from The Rt. Hon. the Earl of Rosebery to Mr R. Marr, SMS Council secretary, 14 April 1881. Cited in note(s) 21
- Slight 1882: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS Coll-1385/5/Letters1882: Letter from John Slight, Treasurer of the U.P Church on behalf of the Owners of 5 Queen Street, Edinburgh to Mr R. Marr, SMS Council secretary, 3 February 1882]. Cited in note(s) 41
- Smith 2009: Graeme Smith, 'The Atheneum, St George's Place (Renamed Nelson Mandela Place) off Buchanan Street, Glasgow', The Music Hall and Theatre History Website (2009): http://www.arthurlloyd.co.uk/Glasgow/Athenae-umGlasgow.htm (accessed 10 December 2015). Cited in note(s) 3
- SMS 1879a: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/3: 'Edinburgh Committee Council Minute Book', p. 1. Cited in note(s) 11, 40, 54, 66, 67, 77, 81, 89
- SMS 1879b: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/6: 'Letter Book'. Cited in note(s) 22, 51
- SMS 1879c: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/8/3: Edinburgh Choral Union Treasurer's Statement 1878–79. Cited in note(s) 44
- SMS 1880a: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Folder 2: SMS Share Application Form [c.1880]. Cited in note(s) 28, 32
- SMS 1880b: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/2: 'SMS General Meeting Minute Book'. Cited in note(s) 36, 39, 47, 59, 60, 61, 64, 70, 71, 76, 86, 90, 91, 93
- SMS 1880c: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/11: Copies of Newspapers and Journals Featuring Advertisements Promoting the SMS *The Scotsman*, (18 June 1880): 3; *The Dundee Advertiser*, (1 July 1880): 1; *The Daily Free Press (Aberdeen)*, (1 July 1880): 1; *Banffshire Journal*, (29 June 1880): 1; *The Scottish Banking and Insurance Magazine*, 2/19, (July 1880): 1; *The Northern Whig (Belfast)*, (2 July 1880): 8; *The Glasgow Herald* (1 July 1880): 1; *The Daily Review (Edinburgh)*, (4 October 1880): 1; *The*

- Edinburgh Courant, (7 October 1880): 1; Banffshire Reporter, (3 July 1880): 1; London Figaro, (7 July 1880): 1; Inverness Courier, (16 March 1882): 1. Cited in note(s) 34
- SMS 1881: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Folder 1: SMS Publicity leaflet (1881). Cited in note(s) 6, 14, 15, 16, 19, 22, 29, 30, 33
- SMS 1882a: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Folder 1: SMS Publicity leaflet: 'Scottish Academy of Music' (1882). Cited in note(s) 24, 31, 56, 72, 74
- SMS 1882b: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Bundle4: SMS Public Meeting Invitation Letters (c.1882). Cited in note(s) 37
- SMS 1883: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, '[Letter to Mr Wm. Cowan, SMS Council member, from the City of Edinburgh town clerk [signature unreadable] on behalf of the Lord Provost, 7 March 1883]', SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/5/Letters1883. Cited in note(s) 40
- SMS 1890a: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/7/2: 'Scottish Universities Commissioners' Draft Ordinance, Edinburgh, No. 2, on the Institution of a Faculty of Music and Regulations for the Reid Professorship of Music in the University of Edinburgh' (1890). Cited in note(s) 80
- SMS 1890b: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/7/1: 'SMS Memorandum to the Scottish Universities Commission, in response to Draft Ordinance, Edinburgh No. 2' (1890). Cited in note(s) 83, 84
- SMS 1891: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/7/3: 'SMS Supplementary Memorandum' (4 April 1891). Cited in note(s) 88, 90
- SMS 1898: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Bundle5: Voluntary Liquidation Resolution Document. Cited in note(s) 93

- SMS 1900: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Bundle7: List of Books and Scores Appended to the Report to the Shareholders (27 February 1900). Cited in note(s) 117
- SMS n.d.a: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/1/Folder 2: SMS Constitution (n.d.). Cited in note(s) 12, 13, 25
- SMS n.d.b: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, SMS EUA CRC Coll-1385/4/2/Bundle1: SMS Balance Sheets and Cash Books (n.d.). Cited in note(s) 75
- SUC 1893: Edinburgh University Library, Special Collections, EUA.P.1: *Supplement to University Calendar 1893–94* [embracing period May to October 1894]. Cited in note(s) 92
- Unknown 1869: [Author unknown], 'Edinburgh Institution for Music', *The Scotsman* (18 September 1869): 5. Cited in note(s) 2
- Unknown 1880a: [Author unknown], 'Limited Liability in Music', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, 21/454 (1880): 593–4. Cited in note(s) 26, 35
- Unknown 1880b: [Author unknown], 'The Scottish Musical Society', *The Scotsman* (18 June 1880): 32
- Unknown 1882: [Author unknown], 'The Scottish Musical Society', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, 23/470 (1882): 214–15. Cited in note(s) 38
- Unknown 1886a: [Author unknown], 'The Music Chair and the Scottish Musical Society', *The Scotsman* (29 October 1886): 6. Cited in note(s) 62
- Unknown 1886b: [Author unknown], 'The Scottish Musical Society', *The Scotsman* (10 November 1886): 7.
- Unknown 1886c: [Author unknown], 'The Scottish Musical Society and the Exhibition Surplus', *The Scotsman* (16 December 1886): 7. Cited in note(s) 63, 64, 66
- Unknown 1890a: [Author unknown], 'Edinburgh University', *The Musical Standard* (21 June, 1890): 577. Cited in note(s) 85
- Unknown 1890b: [Author unknown], 'Music in Edinburgh', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, 31/569 (1890): 414. Cited in note(s) 87

- Unknown 1890c: [Author unknown], 'The Society of Musicians and the Music Chair', *The Scotsman* (3 March 1890): 5. Cited in note(s) 90
- Unknown 1913: [Author unknown], 'Proposed College of Music in Edinburgh', *The Scotsman* (26 November 1913): 12. Cited in note(s) 108
- Unknown n.d.: [Author Unknown], 'William Guthrie Gardiner', University of Glasgow (n.d.): http://www.universitystory.gla.ac.uk/biography/?id=WH0036&type=P (accessed 15 July 2015). Cited in note(s) 105
- Wilson 1993: Conrad Wilson, *Playing for Scotland: The History of the Royal Scottish National Orchestra* (Glasgow: Harper Collins, 1993). Cited in note(s) 52, 57, 94, 102, 103, 104
- W. S. 1886: W. S., 'Letters to the Editor', *The Scotsman* (26 October 1886): 7. Cited in note(s) 62